

## **Guidelines for Selection of Extramural Consultants Appointment as or Promotion to Associate or Full Professor in the Tenure, Clinician-Educator or Research Tracks**

The Provost is the Chief Academic Officer of the University and is responsible for policies relating to the tenure and promotion process. In the Office of the Provost, the Vice Provost for Faculty is responsible for establishing the guidelines and overseeing the process of selecting extramural consultants.

### **General Recommendations:**

- The list should include at least eight consultants in Part A.
- The list should not include more than two consultants from the same institution (per 8 consultants).
- Associate Professor actions (appointments, tenure reviews, promotion) should not include more than two consultants at the Associate Professor (or equivalent) rank.
- Professor actions should only include consultants at the Professor (or equivalent) rank.
- An electronic version of the candidate's CV should be emailed to the office of the Vice Provost for Faculty Affairs ([lotte@upenn.edu](mailto:lotte@upenn.edu)).

Consultants should give a professional evaluation (not a personal reference) containing an unbiased and impartial assessment of a candidate's scholarship, reputation and standing in a specific field. To this end, **any relationship of the consultant to the candidate must be accurately reported**, and follow these guidelines:

- Personal relationships should be avoided.
- Close professional relationships, such as collaborations on publications (co-authorship) or as Co-PIs, should not exceed the stated limit listed below and types of association of those within the limit should be accurately disclosed.
- External consultants having an association with the candidate or department **should not constitute more than one third of the consultants named in Part A**. If additional external consultants are requested as the solicitation process continues, no more than one third of **all** consultants named in Part A of the combined lists should have an association with the candidate or department. Note that additional consultants will need to undergo the same screening and review process as the original consultants.
- Former University of Pennsylvania faculty should not be selected if they left the University less than five years ago. All previous Penn faculty members must be identified as such.
- If the consultant holds an associated faculty appointment at Penn and holds a primary academic appointment elsewhere, he or she is considered an external reviewer. His or her primary appointment rank must be equal to or higher than the rank which is being recommended for appointment or promotion.
- If the consultant holds an associated faculty appointment (visiting faculty, adjunct faculty) at Penn and does not hold or is not active in his or her primary academic appointment elsewhere, he or she is considered an internal reviewer. His or her rank must be equal to or higher than the rank which is being recommended for appointment or promotion in the associated faculty.
- If possible, at least one member of the department's most recent external review committee who is qualified to review the candidate should be included.
- The candidate's thesis advisor cannot serve as an external consultant in Part A. (Note: The thesis advisor can serve as a consultant if nominated by the candidate in Part B).
- No more than one member of the candidate's dissertation committee may be nominated in Part A.

### **Consultants should be:**

- Experts or specialists in the candidate's field or multiple fields if interdisciplinary;
  - Stating that the consultant is an "expert" or "specialist," or indicating the level of the consultant's recognition (regional, national, international) in their given field without supporting the statement with facts is not sufficient. Information describing the expertise of the nominee is required.

- Stating that a consultant is a member of a graduate group or clinical trial is not sufficient. Information describing the expertise of the nominee is required.

To illustrate the point above, refer to the following samples for appropriate descriptions of consultants' qualifications:

- Regionally, nationally or internationally recognized for making advances (specify which) in ... (indicate the exact field of study). (Note: This is not the same as stating that a nominee is "internationally recognized as a leader in the field.")
  - Member of consortium that provides services ( indicate type) in the field of (describe specific area)
  - Pioneered the ... (provide description).
  - Discovered the ...(provide description)
  - President of ... (name of Society, Committee, etc.); include year(s) office(s) held.
  - Chair of ... (name of Department, Society, Committee, etc.); include year(s) office(s) held.
  - Editor of ... (state name of professional journal, etc.)
  - Author of ... (publication related to area of expertise of the candidate)
  - Winner of ... (prize or award in related area of expertise)
- From peer institutions and/or institutions known for work in the specific field; if the consultant is not from a peer institution, include an explanation supporting the grounds for choosing the consultant;
  - At an academic rank equal to or higher than the rank for which is being proposed but no more than a maximum of two consultants at the rank of Associate Professor.
  - **Perelman School of Medicine only:** Different from those named in the educational database or teaching chronicle.

**Depending on the track, the consultant will be asked to provide:**

- An assessment of the scope, importance and significance of the candidate's scholarly accomplishments.
- Focused comments on the nature, substance, and quality of the candidate's teaching, clinical and service contributions.
- A list of several peers within the candidate's discipline and an assessment of the candidate's standing with respect to these individuals.
- An estimate of the likelihood of the candidate achieving a similar rank and tenure at other institutions comparable to Penn.
- Other evidence of stature of the individual as indicated by administration of a division or program, leadership at the regional or national level of committees or study sections, participation in continuing education programs or invited lectures.
- Any additional comments on qualifications.

**Approval process:**

Review and approval of the consultants is designated by the signatures of the Chair of the Personnel Committee, the Dean, and the Vice Provost for Faculty. Signatures should be secured in that order. [Note: Promotion to Professor, Professor CE or Research Professor does not require Vice Provost approval; however, the guidelines for selection should be followed].

**Contact with External Consultants:**

- The Department Chair, Personnel Committee Chair, or Dean may contact the external consultants to ascertain his or her willingness to review a candidate's scholarly achievements prior to sending out the review packets. This pre-contact may not occur until the list has been approved by the Vice Provost for Faculty.
- There should be no attempt to determine if the consultant is willing to provide a positive evaluation of the candidate's work.

- To avoid establishing a biased and potentially inaccurate dossier, it is NOT acceptable to discuss the case with a proposed consultant.
- If a letter of evaluation has not been received by the stated deadline, the Department Chair, Personnel Committee Chair, or Dean may contact an external consultant for the sole purpose of determining whether the consultant intends to send the requested letter.
- The Department Chair, Personnel Committee Chair, or Dean may delegate the task of contacting external consultants to a staff member.

**NOTE:** *When soliciting the consultant, please use only the Provost-approved, track-specific solicitation letter. If a consultant is being asked to evaluate a candidate who received an extension(s) to his or her probationary period, please be sure to use the solicitation letter that includes the appropriate provision. If you are uncertain about which letter to use, please contact the office of the Vice Provost for Faculty ([notte@upenn.edu](mailto:notte@upenn.edu)).*