Learning Goals

- Practice proving asymptotic bounds with code snippets
- Practice solving recurrences using the methods of iteration and recurrence trees

Code Snippets

We can apply our knowledge of Big-Oh and summations to find the run time of a snippet of our code. Besides recursion, nested iteration is where our code’s efficiency will be bottlenecked. We should consider the loop as a summation, and use our knowledge to simplify it from there. Try starting from the innermost loop with fixed bounds and working outwards.

Problems

Problem 1

Problem 1 a

Provide a running time analysis of the following loop. That is, find both Big-Oh and Big-Ω:

```java
for (int i = 0; i < n; i++)
    for (int j = i; j <= n; j++)
        for (int k = i; k <= j; k++)
            sum++;
```

Problem 1 b

Provide a running time analysis of the following loop:

```java
for (int i = 4; i < n; i = i*i)
    for (int j = 2; j < Math.sqrt(i); j = j+j)
        System.out.println("*");
```

Recurrences

As you have seen in class, recurrences are equations that can help us describe the running time of a recursive algorithm.

You have thus far seen two different ways of solving recurrences:

- **Iteration.** In this method, we expand \( T(n) \) fully by substitution and solve for \( T(n) \) directly.
- **Recursion trees.** In this method, we draw the recursive calls to \( T(n) \) in a tree format and count the amount of work done in each level of the tree.

In this lab, we will focus on the method of iteration.

Let’s first go through some examples before running through problems.
Example: Method of Iteration I
Let’s examine the following recurrence $T(n)$.

$$T(n) = \begin{cases} T(n-1) + n & n \geq 1 \\ 0 & \text{otherwise} \end{cases}$$

Using the method of iteration, we expand $T(n)$ as follows:

$$T(n) = T(n-1) + n$$

$$= [T(n-2) + (n-1)] + n$$

$$= [[T(n-3) + (n-2)] + (n-1)] + n$$

$$\vdots$$

$$= \sum_{i=1}^{n} i$$

$$= \frac{1}{2} (n+1)(n) = \left( \frac{n+1}{2} \right) = \Theta(n^2)$$

Example: Method of Iteration II
This is a more complex version of the recurrence in problem 1c. What makes this tricky is all of the algebraic manipulation, but the strategy of setting the problem up is the same! Note: this is probably the most difficult things will get in terms of solving recurrences via iteration.

$$T(n) = \begin{cases} 2T\left(\frac{n}{3}\right) + \sqrt{n} & n \geq 1 \\ 1 & \text{otherwise} \end{cases}$$

This is tricky, but let’s jump right in. First, let’s assume that $n$ is some power of 3 such that $n = 3^k \implies k = \log_3 n$.

$$T(n) = 2T\left(\frac{n}{3}\right) + \sqrt{n}$$

$$= 2 \left( 2T\left(\frac{n}{3^2}\right) + \sqrt{\frac{n}{3}} \right) + \sqrt{n}$$

$$= 2 \left( 2 \left( 2T\left(\frac{n}{3^3}\right) + \sqrt{\frac{n}{3^2}} \right) + \sqrt{\frac{n}{3}} \right) + \sqrt{n}$$

$$\vdots$$

We can also write

$$2T\left(\frac{n}{3}\right) = 2^2T\left(\frac{n}{3^2}\right) + 2\sqrt{\frac{n}{3}}$$

$$2^2T\left(\frac{n}{3^2}\right) = 2^3T\left(\frac{n}{3^3}\right) + 2^2\sqrt{\frac{n}{3^2}}$$

$$\vdots$$

$$2^{k-1}T\left(\frac{n}{3^{k-1}}\right) = 2^kT\left(\frac{n}{3^k}\right) + 2^{k-1}\sqrt{\frac{n}{3^{k-1}}$$
If we add all of the equations above and subtract common terms, we end up with the following (also using the base case..)

\[
T(n) = \sqrt{n} + 2 \sqrt{\frac{n}{3}} + 2^2 \sqrt{\frac{n}{3^2}} + \cdots + 2^{k-1} \sqrt{\frac{n}{3^{k-1}}} + 2^k
\]

\[
= 2^k + \sqrt{n} \sum_{i=0}^{k-1} \left( \frac{2}{\sqrt{3}} \right)^i
\]

\[
= 2^k + \sqrt{n} \left[ \frac{2^k \sqrt{3} - 1}{2 \sqrt{3} - 1} \right]
\]

\[
= 2^{\log_3 n} + \sqrt{\frac{3n}{\sqrt{n} \left( \frac{2^{\log_3 n}}{\sqrt{n} - 1} \right)}}
\]

\[
= 2^{\log_3 n} + \frac{\sqrt{3}}{2 - \sqrt{3}} (2^{\log_3 n} - \sqrt{n})
\]

\[
= n^{\log_3 2} + cn^{\log_3 2} - cn^{\frac{1}{2}}
\]

\[
= 2^{\log_3 n} = n^{\log_3 2} = \Theta(n^{\log_3 2})
\]

That last step might be a bit confusing. We observe that \( \log_3 2 \approx 0.6 = 0.5 + \epsilon \) for some positive \( \epsilon \). (We introduce \( \epsilon \) to make evaluating the limit simpler.) We can confirm that \( T(n) \) is in fact \( \Theta(n^{\log_3 2}) \) via the limit definition of Big-\( \Theta \).

\[
\lim_{n \to \infty} \frac{(c+1)n^{0.5+\epsilon} - cn^{0.5}}{n^{0.5+\epsilon}} = c + 1
\]

Therefore, we have a Big-\( \Theta \).

**Example: Method of Recursion Trees**

Let’s examine the recurrence of merge sort. For those that are unfamiliar with it, the algorithm works by taking an unsorted array, sorting the left and right halves of the array recursively, and then merging the two sorted halves together to end up with the final sorted list. Let \( T(n) \) represent the time the algorithm takes for an input of size \( n \). Since the two halves are sorted recursively by the same algorithm, but with inputs that are each half the size of the original, each half should take time \( T(n/2) \). The merging takes linear time. So we can write \( T(n) = 2 \cdot T(n/2) + cn \) for some constant \( c \). The recursion-tree is shown below.
Note that at the very top level (i.e., the end of the algorithm), it costs \( cn \) to merge the two sorted halves of the array. But to get there, we needed to solve the two problems of size \( \frac{n}{2} \). Each costs \( c \cdot \frac{n}{2} \) to solve. Therefore, across that level, the total cost is \( c \cdot \frac{n}{2} + c \cdot \frac{n}{2} = cn \). We can continue this all the way until we get to the very bottom of the tree, which are single elements. Note then that every level ends up costing \( cn \). The height of the tree is \( \log n \). Therefore, the total cost is \( c \cdot n \log n \).

To see why the height is \( \log n \), observe that subproblem sizes decrease by a factor of 2 each time we go down one level, we stop when we reach singleton elements. The subproblem size for a node at depth \( i \) is \( \frac{n}{2^i} \). Thus, the subproblem size hits \( n = 1 \) when \( \frac{n}{2^i} = 1 \) or, equivalently, when \( i = \log n \). You can read more examples in CLRS 4.4.

**Problems**

You may assume in the following cases that \( n \) is either some power of 2 or 3. You may also find the following helpful:

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Geometric series:</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>[ \sum_{i=0}^{k} q^i = \frac{q^{k+1} - 1}{q - 1} = \frac{1 - q^{k+1}}{1 - q} ]</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Sum of binomial coefficients over upper index:</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>[ \sum_{j=0}^{n} \binom{j}{m} = \binom{n+1}{m+1} ]</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
Problem 1

Problem. Solve the following recurrences.

1. \[ T(n) = \begin{cases} T(n-1) + \binom{n}{2} & n \geq 2 \\ 1 & \text{otherwise} \end{cases} \]

2. \[ T(n) = \begin{cases} 2T\left(\frac{n}{2}\right) + n^2 & n \geq 1 \\ 1 & \text{otherwise} \end{cases} \]

3. \[ T(n) = \begin{cases} 2T\left(\frac{n}{4}\right) + n & n \geq 1 \\ 1 & \text{otherwise} \end{cases} \]

4. \[ T(n) = \begin{cases} T(n-1) + 2^n & n \geq 1 \\ 1 & \text{otherwise} \end{cases} \]

5. \[ T(n) = \begin{cases} T(\sqrt{n}) + 1 & n \geq 1 \\ 1 & \text{otherwise} \end{cases} \]

Problem 2

The CIS160 and CIS121 TAs are having another social gathering after going to see the Pigeonhole Principle Players of Philadelphia (PPPP). For some reason or another, the 160 TAs particularly enjoy playing the Tower of Hanoi and insist that the 121 TAs compete with them to see who can solve the game the fastest. Of course, the clever 121 TAs are very proficient with their running time analysis skills, and know that an optimal strategy is detailed by the following code:

```c
function HANOITOWER(h, from, to, mid)
    if h ≥ 1 then
        HANOITOWER(h - 1, from, mid, to)
        MoveDisk(from, to) \(\triangleright O(1) \text{ time operation} \)
        HANOITOWER(h - 1, mid, to, from)
    end
```

Problem. What is the running time of the above algorithm? Prove it inductively.